

Name:

	1 point: 100 words or less <b>AND</b> Closely follows the outline in the instructions	0 points: Greater than 100 words <b>OR</b> Requires reorganization
Abstract		

	4 points: Motivated by big-picture importance <b>AND</b> Intuition behind hypotheses/mechanisms <b>AND</b> Gets progressively narrower until research question	2 points: Motivated mostly by gap in literature <b>OR</b> Motivation lacks big-picture importance <b>OR</b> Sparse intuition behind hypotheses <b>OR</b> Varies in breadth between broad and narrow until research question	0 points: [Motivated mostly by gap in literature OR Motivation lacks big-picture importance OR Sparse intuition behind hypotheses] <b>AND</b> Varies in breadth between broad and narrow
Motivation			

	2 points: Adequate level of detail on economic context <b>AND</b> Policy context based on facts, not conjecture <b>AND</b> Clear connection to research question/ empirical strategy	1 point: Too much or too little detail on economic context <b>OR</b> Some conjecture about policy context <b>OR</b> Economic context is only weakly connected to research question/ empirical strategy	0 points: [Too much or too little detail on economic context OR Mostly conjecture about policy context] <b>AND</b> Economic context is only weakly connected to research question/empirical strategy
Context			

	2 points: At least 3 papers cited from economics journals <b>AND</b> Citations distributed throughout intro <b>AND</b> Highlights own contribution relative to existing literature	1 point: Less than 3 papers cited from economics journals <b>OR</b> Citations lumped in a "literature review" portion <b>OR</b> Own contribution relative to existing literature is unclear	0 point: Less than 3 papers cited from economics journals <b>AND</b> [Citations lumped in a "literature review" portion OR Own contribution relative to existing literature is unclear]
Literature			

	2 points: Names the data source and sample years <b>AND</b> Clear estimation method (e.g., DD, RD, etc.) <b>AND</b> Outcome and main independent variables defined <b>AND</b> Intuition behind identification is clear	1 point: Does not fully name data source/sample years <b>OR</b> Estimation method is unclear (e.g., DD, RD, etc.) <b>OR</b> Outcome or main independent variables not clearly defined <b>OR</b> Intuition behind identification is unclear	0 points: [Does not fully name data source/sample years OR Estimation method is unclear (e.g., DD, RD, etc.) OR Outcome or main independent variables not clearly defined] <b>AND</b> Intuition behind identification is unclear
Data, Empirical Strategy, and Identification			

	4 points: Paragraph topics build upon each other <b>AND</b> Paragraph topics get narrower throughout <b>AND</b> No spelling or grammatical errors <b>AND</b> Very few "awkward sentence structure" comments	2 points: Some paragraph topics are out of order <b>OR</b> Paragraph topics vary in breadth <b>OR</b> Several spelling or grammatical errors <b>OR</b> Several "awkward sentence structure" comments	0 points: [Some paragraph topics are out of order OR Paragraph topics vary in breadth] <b>AND</b> [Several spelling or grammatical errors OR Several "awkward sentence structure" comments]
Writing			

Notes: